

Modern Slavery Core Outcome Set e-Delphi Round 1 Results

Thank you for participating in Round 1 of our E-Delphi on outcomes for recovery, wellbeing, and reintegration for survivors of modern slavery and human trafficking. We are grateful for all the positive comments we received. Participants identifying as survivors emphasised how our outcomes reflected their lived experience around consistency and stability, the need for purpose, and difficulties being believed by healthcare practitioners and the police. More generally, respondents commented that our outcomes were energising, had the potential for positive change and provided a valuable, multi-faceted insight into survivor wellbeing.

Who Participated

We had an exceptional response, building on our Round 0 engagement. In total, 64 people participated in Round 1, up from 53 in Round 0. Of these, there were 43 people identifying as survivors, 9 as service providers, 8 as researchers and 4 as policymakers or people working in policy. As with Round 0, respondents were from a wide range of ethnicities, identifying as Asian, White, British, African, Indian, Bangladeshi, Nigerian, Greek and much more. Of the 64 respondents, 46 were living in the UK but there were also people living in South Africa, the USA, Kenya, Nigeria, Cameroon and India. Our 18 international respondents in Round 1 represents an increase from the 10 in Round 0 and is a trend we hope to continue. Finally, 54 survey respondents identified as female and 10 as male. This is double the number of men (5) we reached in Round 0, though there is still room for improvement.

Rating Results

We asked you to read each of our 72 outcomes and choose from strongly disagree, disagree, neither agree nor disagree, agree, strongly agree according to how much you agreed that this outcome should be included in the final core outcome set. The outcomes were incredibly difficult to rate, with most people choosing 'strongly agree' or 'agree.' Out of 4,608 ratings, only 36 (less than 1%) were either 'disagree' or 'strongly disagree'. Some people also chose the 'neither agree nor disagree' option. We produced a score for each outcome by subtracting the number of people selecting 'neither agree nor disagree' from the number of people selecting 'strongly agree'. By using these two numbers our score included both those who felt strongly positive about certain, and those who were ambivalent about certain outcomes (almost no one felt negatively). This allowed us to produce a ranking table for each outcome (Table 1).

Table 1 – Ranking the longlist of outcomes

Outcome	Rating
Safety from any trafficker or other abuser	46
Compassionate, trauma-informed staff behaviour	43
Long term, consistent support	40
Secure and protected housing	40
Access to education	40
Dignified treatment of survivors	37
Survival needs and state support	37
Access to medical treatment	35
Preventing re-exploitation	35

Knowledge of rights and entitlements	35
Processing trauma	34
Access to quality legal representation	34
No racism	33
Being able to trust support workers and other practitioners	32
Having people to talk to	32
Healthy relationships	31
Belief and respect from public authorities, courts, and tribunals	30
Housing stability and independence	29
Timely and sustained psychological support	29
Better immigration systems	29
Quality, well-resourced support	29
Improving policy	29
Survivor leadership	29
Life skills	28
Dignity in living conditions	28
Survivor choice in services	28
Inclusive and sensitive support	28
Immigration status and documentation	27
Amplifying survivor voices and creating change	27
Being part of a community	27
Respect and recognition from healthcare practitioners and service providers	27
Reclaiming Normalcy and Appreciating the Everyday	26
Self-compassion, acceptance and self-worth	26
Moving on and starting a new life	26
A safe mental health service, work and home environment	25
Obtaining and maintaining meaningful employment	25
MEDIAN 24.5	
Coping with mental health problems	24
Being able to seek support	24
Service accountability	24
Finding purpose in life and self-actualisation	24
Permission to work	22
Being financially responsible for self and others	21
Advocating for self and giving to others	21
Improved understanding of mental health treatments	20
Less public judgment, more understanding	20
Self-sufficiency, control and independence	19
Obtaining meaningful qualifications	18
Affordable and reliable transportation	17
No discrimination against LGBTQ+	17

Freedom of movement	17
Living in an appropriate or desired location	17
Living a stigma free life	17
LOWER QUARTILE	
Self-awareness and emotional expression	16
Improved physical wellbeing	16
Prosecutions	16
Recognition of activism	16
Meaningful and creative activities	16
Career progression	16
Family reunification	14
Grappling with and tackling oppression	14
Personal and family prosperity	14
Self-expression and opportunity through host country language	14
Celebrating and thinking positively	13
Healthy lifestyle	12
Feeling comfortable in social environment	12
Socialising	12
Increased male involvement	11
Keeping busy	9
Solidarity and being part of a movement	9
Family safety and contact	9
Reclaiming the past	6
Spiritual wellbeing	4

At the end of the survey, we asked everyone to choose their top 5 outcomes among all the 72. Though many people did this, some people instead chose their top 5 domains. We have reported the results from both sets of answers in **Table 2** and **Table 3**.

Table 2 – Outcomes with Top 5 votes

Top 5 Outcomes	
Preventing Re-exploitation	7
Immigration status and documentation	6
Housing stability and independence	6
Secure and protected housing	5
Meaningful employment	5
Access to education	5
Access to medical treatments	5
Safety from any trafficker	4
Processing trauma	4
Compassionate trauma-informed staff	4

Socialising	3
Timely and sustained psychological support	3
Self-compassion, acceptance and self-worth	3
Improving policy	3
Quality services	3
Life Skills	3
Healthy relationships	2
Being part of a community	2
No racism	2
Legal representation	2
Permission to work	2
Personal and family prosperity	2
Being able to seek support	2
Finding purpose in life and self-actualisation	2
Survivor leadership	2
Reclaiming the past	2
Being able to trust support workers	2
Affordable transportation	2
Having people to talk to	1
No discrimination against LGBTQ+	1
Immigration systems/status	1
Dignity in living conditions	1
Family reunification	1
Expression through host country language	1
Moving on	1
Reclaiming normalcy	1
Increase male involvement	1
Service Accountability	1
Safe mental health environment	1
Financial responsibility	1

Table 3 – Domains with Top 5 votes

Top 5 Domains	
Safety	31
Opportunities	20
Rights, Justice and Dignity	18
Supportive Services	18
Health and Wellbeing	16
Consistency and Stability	12
Recognition, Understanding and Awareness	7

Belonging and Social Support	7
Creating change	7
Agency and Purpose	5

Narrowing Down the Outcomes for Round 2

We used the outcome rankings, your responses for the top 5 outcomes and domains, as well as the comments you provided, to begin the process of narrowing down our outcomes list so that we can determine the core outcome set. Anything under the middle-ranked outcome was considered for removal, with those in the bottom quarter especially at risk. We merged or removed outcomes if they were part of an unpopular domain or if there were several negative comments about the outcome. We saved the outcome if it had received at least three top 5 votes. After this process, we were left with 34 outcomes from an original list of 72.

We also merged the two least popular domains, 'creating change' and 'agency purpose', based on your comments and the fact that very few outcomes remained in these after the removal and merging process. We, therefore, also reduced the number of domains from 10 to 9.

Safety	
Safety from any trafficker or other abuser	This outcome includes a safe rescue process e.g. avoiding the pick-up of cases at night, making female police escorts available for female cases. Sustained safety from traffickers is also critical and includes freedom from fear that exploiters will recapture survivors, find out where they are, or threaten them in some way. Ongoing safety can involve multiple aspects such as: having a landline to call emergency services in a safe house; living far from traffickers and their associates; and, the police being careful in the way they handle cases. This outcome would also include psychological safety from traffickers, such as psychoeducation on the techniques of manipulation used etc.
Secure and suitable housing	Survivors should live in a place they can call home, where they feel safe and secure, can exercise freedom and independence, and live without exploitation. This outcome includes the provision of gender-sensitive accommodation, proper investigation of complaints within housing, having hygienic accommodation, having cooking and cleaning facilities, feeling respected in the home environment, having private personal space, a lack of overcrowding, having enough peace and quiet to be able to sleep, and not having to worry about being evicted.
Preventing re-exploitation	This outcome is about appropriate protection from future exploitation. This includes improved protection from further exploitation by media and researchers, as well as ensuring survivor privacy. Survivors need to be well informed about their personal rights and how exploitation may occur in a variety of contexts.
A safe mental health service, work and home environment	This outcome is about survivors having safe spaces to engage in therapeutic work and to express themselves in. Mental health services can become safer spaces in a number of ways, such as: using gender sensitive services, increasing alternatives to hospitalisation, offering therapy in survivors' own languages, creative or arts-based therapies, and group therapy with other survivors. A safe home environment where survivors can talk freely and receive help means that there is place that therapy can happen, and a safe work and home environment also means that psychological treatment is not set back by home or work stressors and mental health needs are taken into consideration at home and at work.

Supportive services	
Compassionate, trauma-informed services	This outcome describes the need for staff who show empathy not sympathy, who are trained and experienced in distressing cases, and avoid retraumatizing survivors. Survivors need to be able to trust support workers, social workers, and shelter staff. This means developing a rapport with people, keeping promises, communicating to survivors in their language, and being honest. At a very basic level, this outcome is about staff treating survivors as human, listening to their stories and needs, and being a positive force in people's lives. All services need to be as inclusive and sensitively delivered as possible.
Service accountability	Services and charity organisations need to be transparent and accountable, and survivors should feel heard and able to contribute to improvements in services. This includes having efficient complaints systems that survivors feel safe using, having information available on how and who to complain to when necessary, and that charity and service staff are held accountable for their actions.
Quality, well-resourced support	This outcome describes the need for quality support services. Quality support services is where there is time to discuss issues, dedicated caseworkers survivors can build a relationship with, where staff do not feel overloaded, and where waiting lists are short. Quality services are tailored to the specific needs of survivors of human trafficking. Good services share information and work in partnership with other services to make certain that their work is complementary. To ensure quality, services should be robustly monitored.
Survivor choice in services	Survivors should have a choice in the type of services they receive and when they receive them. For instance, survivors should be able to receive services, especially mental health support, at a pace they are comfortable with.
Consistency and Stability	
Long term, consistent support	This outcome is about psychological support that is available at the right time and when it is asked for. It is important that survivors are able to access support that is long-term and available for as long as is desired. This support should also be consistent, and enable survivors able to build a relationship and trust with caseworkers. Staff should also be supported so that they do not burn out and can provide the long-term consistent support needed.
Life skills	Life skills are the skills needed to participate in society and be independent. They cover a range of areas including budgeting, cleaning and cooking. It also includes soft skills such as communication skills, and understanding social values or norms. Underlying everything are executive functioning skills (e.g. beginning and finishing a task, being able to organise resources, and to be able to facilitate task completion) and occupational performance skills (e.g. concentration, problem solving, maintaining appearance).
Reclaiming Normalcy and Appreciating the Everyday	This outcome is about a desire to reclaim a sense of routine and normalcy. It is to be able to enjoy everyday life free from the shadow of trafficking. This means being able to have a consistent family and romantic life; a regular, balanced schedule encompassing friends, education and employment; and feeling like you have the same basic life as everyone else.
Opportunities	
Access to education	Access to education means having money for transport to educational institutions, the legal permission to study (sometimes denied by immigration laws), the availability of free courses and colleges who do not discriminate. Access to education also

	includes foundational courses for work preparedness as well as less formal elements, such as being able to learn and practice new skills e.g. sewing, art and design, etc.
Obtaining and maintaining meaningful employment	This outcome describes survivors need to obtain decent employment and the tools required to do so. Survivors need an understanding of the host country job market, to obtain relevant work experience, and to feel capable of working. A key element of this outcome is employer understanding around human trafficking, being flexible with working arrangements and not discriminating against people because they lack understanding about people's permission to work or why their CV might be affected.
Rights Justice and Dignity	
Survival needs and state support	This is an outcome about having access to basic necessities such as food, clothing, sanitary provisions, and shelter. It also includes being able to access financial support from the government or charities for housing and services.
No racism	Survivors should not be subjected to dehumanising or criminalising treatment by government institutions, social workers, first responders, and service providers. Institutional racism must be tackled in and by health care systems and institutions.
Access to quality legal representation	This outcome describes a need for survivors to have access to specialist legal advice and to legal counsel with complex case knowledge specifically around the topic of modern slavery and human trafficking. Quality legal representation also includes having translation services in legal settings, legal aid funding that reflects the complexity of cases, and advocacy supporting all elements of cases (from compensation to survivor preparation for court). Funding for childcare to make attending the legal process possible is also crucial here.
Better immigration systems	This outcome is about survivors' experiences of navigating immigration and state systems. This includes having clear and timely communications about immigration and support during application processes, responsive communication channels to engage with government departments and authorities with delays in state support or asylum cases being explained, improving waiting times for an asylum decision, a less adversarial asylum interview process, and even automatically receiving immigration status for survivors.
Immigration status and documentation	This outcome is about having security through obtaining immigration status or the right to remain in your current location. Having a secure immigration status and appropriate documentation is important to ensure human rights and entitlements for survivors including, access to governmental financial support and health services. Survivors should not have to live with the fear of deportation.
Health and Wellbeing	
Access to medical treatment	This outcome is about ensuring that all physical and mental health needs are met. This includes having access to medical and dental treatment, for example through transport funding to attend appointments and money for therapy. It also includes being registered to a GP and could include culturally appropriate support (e.g. acupuncture). There is a desperate need for therapists who are informed in this area and so are equipped to help survivors. Specific group therapies should exist for survivors.

Processing trauma	Processing trauma means reaching a place where the memory of the trauma does not impact the body and emotions as strongly, or feeling as if traumatic memories do not have the same emotional quality they once had. This does not mean invalidating the past, but instead being able to speak about what happened if you choose to. Overcoming trauma and anxiety could include finding ways to distract yourself from memories/thoughts, learning mindfulness and deep breathing strategies, and having psychological resources to care for the self.
Self-compassion, acceptance and self-worth	This outcome is about supporting survivors to prioritise mental health by building self-esteem, having self-love, and cultivating inner strength. This involves survivors not blaming themselves and not doing things just for others but also for themselves. It also involves acceptance which means letting go of the past and accepting that it cannot be changed, but also that a full recovery may or may not exist. Finally this also involves feeling less shame and guilt about the past and current situation (such as accommodation, employment).
Being able to seek support	Being able to seek support includes having the confidence to access services, and being able to reach out and talk honestly to a mental health support worker if needed.
Coping with mental health problems	This outcome is about developing coping strategies for poor mental health (including flashbacks, paranoia, depression, and anxiety). Coping with poor mental health such as grounding techniques for dissociation can help survivors to reduce and manage triggers, prevent breakdowns, reduce medications and hospitalisations, as well as changing potentially harmful behaviours.
Recognition, awareness and understanding	
Knowledge of rights and entitlements	An understanding of the immigration process is crucial for many survivors, particularly when people have precarious status and limited rights. For those with secure status, it is important to understand the welfare system and how to navigate complex state systems (health, criminal justice, employment), and to be given information in languages and formats that are accessible to them. There is a concomitant demand for accurate, timely, and clear information from those who worked with survivors and from official government services. Finally, it is important for those who interacted with survivors to have deep rather than superficial knowledge about human trafficking to prevent the denial of rights and ensure safeguarding responsibilities are understood and upheld.
Dignified treatment and belief	This outcome is about fair treatment of survivors by institutions, public officials, service providers and first responders such as the police. Legal and law enforcement staff should have specialised training to support survivors and work on trafficking cases. Health practitioners and service providers should take survivor concerns seriously, keeping any scepticism to themselves, and carrying out meaningful assessments without judgement or discrimination. Survivors need authorities and public officials to believe them when they make judgments about their credibility and vulnerability, particularly during immigration interviews and when housing or social service decisions are being made.
Living a stigma free life	This outcome is about how survivors can often be seen solely as victims, without the ability to solve their own problems or make a life for themselves. Survivors are clear that this stereotype has negative mental health implications and must be avoided. For example, being in the legal system is a critical barrier to rising out of victimising

	stereotypes because in the legal system, the victim framing is used to avoid criminalisation.
Belonging and social support	
Having people to talk to	This outcome is about having someone compassionate and supportive to talk to. This could be a good friend, a partner or a social worker. It is about not being alone with difficult memories and feelings in post-trafficking life, and having someone to reach out to when times are tough.
Healthy relationships	Healthy relationships concern both intimate partners and friends. It is important that intimate relationships don't replicate the exploitative dynamics experienced in trafficking around dependency, abuse and negativity. It is important for survivors to gain an understanding of what healthy relationships look like. Healthy relationships involve being able to assert boundaries and being able to say no. Having healthy relationships also means having friends you are able to enjoy spending time with and who give you hope. Healthy relationships are equal on both sides. This outcome also means having the confidence to meet and be open to new people, while maintaining control over who is trusted.
Being part of a community	This outcome describes being supported to be part of a community. This community could be a local one formed of neighbours, one formed around shared interests and hobbies, one centred on nationality, a survivor network, or even just family. It is important that survivors, who may have been excluded or marginalised from their communities pre-trafficking are able to re-enter society.
Socialising	Socialising encompasses going out with friends, having charity organised activities to attend, or participating in online social activities. It doesn't necessarily mean that more socialising is always wanted, rather it is important to have the choice and opportunity to socialise when desired. Long-term or ongoing socialising opportunities, such as through a buddy system might also be important for survivors. Socialising could be in the digital realm as well as face-to-face, and it is vital that survivors are able to use social media and have support to pay the internet.
Agency and purpose	
Improving policy	Survivors want to see changes in the policies that affect them and more direct engagement with survivors from policy makers. This includes creating alternative routes to obtaining visas or immigration status, and well-funded services that respond to survivors' needs. The ability of survivors to influence government and organisations will help put these changes into action.
Survivor leadership	This outcome is about survivors' have the choice and support to have their voices heard and assume leadership positions within NGOs and broader society. For survivors to become leaders, it is important that services treat them as partners and allies. This means including survivors not just in informing/advising services, but as staff members, mentors and in leadership positions where they can make a difference. Positive representations of survivors and survivor successes in their chosen fields is also important. These strong voices can create change by challenging oppression, changing policy, and educating others.

<p>Moving on and starting a new life</p>	<p>This outcome is about the ability to create plans for the future and embrace moving forward to build a new life. Being able to start afresh without letting the past interfere with the future (whilst still not forgetting what has happened) is important for survivors. This requires recovering physically, having the mental space necessary to plan for the future and to reclaiming a sense of personal identity. Reclaiming personal identity for survivors may involve processing the world anew- parts of our personalities can be lost during trauma. Moving on is about rediscovering, or discovering, what we think/feel/want from the world.</p>
<p>Finding purpose in life and self-actualisation</p>	<p>This outcome is about a feeling of optimism and fulfilment. The idea of being able to have hope to dream and desire to live is crucial here, and also being able to tolerate good and bad days without fully losing this sense of hope. It is most importantly about self-actualisation- which is the ability to follow passions in life and living life to the fullest. This could include using talents, setting goals for self-improvement, and articulating personal goals and dreams.</p>

What does this mean for the Full Outcome List

Though we have reduced the number of outcomes from the previous round, it is important to note that the longlist of 72 outcomes will remain an important public resource for people conducting research, evaluation, designing and delivering services, and making policy. Our goal now, is to arrive at a list of around 8 core outcomes that will be present a minimum standard to be measured and considered across all interventions, services and policy. They can and should, however, be supplemented by further outcomes from the longlist.

Important Feedback from participants

The outcomes were also adjusted a little based on the comments you gave. We received general feedback that the descriptions were very expansive; we have shortened them accordingly. We also read several comments imploring that survivor leadership should be phrased as a supported individual choice, rather than a target that every survivor must achieve. This outcome has been adjusted to make clear that we are advocating for the choice and ability to lead if so desired.

We again received feedback from academics that it is confusing having a mix of outcomes on individual, group, societal, cultural and governmental levels. We have now added a definition of ‘outcome’ to our E-Delphi to make it clear that we are including broad, creative and societal outcomes as well as standard individual level wellbeing and health related outcomes. Our definition of an outcome is the result of a planned action facilitated by an outside party or programme with the aim of facilitating survivor healing post-trafficking either directly or indirectly’.